

CYH2A
Affordable Housing

CYH5A
Residential Density

CYSP8
Reducing dependence on the car

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 Internal

City Development - The site is allocated in the Local Plan as an employment site for B1, B2, and B8 uses under policy E3a. Therefore there is no policy objection to the light industrial proposals within this application.

Policy E3b seeks to protect existing and proposed employment sites. There is a lack of evidence to suggest there is a sufficient supply of employment land for future use and the applicant hasn't adequately justified why this part of the site would not be viable for employment uses (B1/B2/B8).

PPS3 refers to relocating employment or other land to housing. However, it states that such allocations should be reviewed as part of reviewing development plans. Future land allocations in the City of York will be determined through the preparation of the Local Development Framework. As part of preparing the LDF the Council are undertaking a review of employment land and a housing land availability study to inform future land allocations.

Affordable Housing

On the last withdrawn application (ref 06/01594/OUT) one of the reasons for refusal given in the officer's report was the lack of affordable housing proposed with the application, as the site area exceeded 0.3ha. The previous application was therefore in conflict with policy H2a. On the current application, although the same number of units are proposed, the site area has been reduced to 0.278ha in order to avoid triggering the affordable housing policy. This has been achieved by removing a section of land to the west of the site from the application site boundary.

The affordable housing advice note makes it clear that site splitting is unacceptable if it would result in the loss of affordable housing. In this case the site is not exactly being split but reduced in size to avoid the policy requirements.

If the principle of residential development is accepted here there may be future applications on the remainder of the site area for residential rather than employment uses. As the residential element of this particular application only relates to part of the land available (both in terms of the site area of previous applications and the mixed development overall) mechanisms need to be in place to prevent piecemeal residential development which avoids the affordable housing contribution. Small parcels of land coming forward under the threshold will be considered in terms of the total number of units approved when the affordable housing provision is calculated.

Housing Mix

As the application is made in outline form there is no detailed information available on the proposed mix and type of units proposed. It would be appropriate to attach a condition to any approval requiring approval of the proposed mix and type at reserved matters stage, in accordance with policy H3c and with regard to the latest Housing Market Assessment.

Environmental Protection Unit - No objections to this application. However, the proposed residential dwellings are in close proximity to the proposed industrial development and existing industrial area. Therefore there is a concern regarding the occupants of the dwellings being adversely affected by noise from the potential use of the industrial units. There are also concerns about the potential contamination of the site. 2 conditions and an informative were suggested to be added to any approval.

Lifelong Learning and Culture - As there is no on-site open space, commuted sums would need to be paid to the Council in line with local plan policies.

Highway Network Management - Unit 4 has 42 proposed car parking spaces. Appendix E of the Local Plan indicates that this unit can have a maximum of 25 spaces. The supporting information consistently quotes how sustainable the site is in terms of public transport provisions and pedestrian and cycle access so there is no reason for the increased levels of parking. No objections to the residential aspect of the development.

Archaeology - The site lies adjacent to a scheduled ancient monument and an archaeological watching brief condition should be included with any approval.

3.2 External

Clifton Without Parish Council - Object because the site is designated for employment and light industry use only.

Site Notice / Press Advert / Neighbour Letters - 20 individual letters and 17 standard template letters received. The following points were raised:

- Hornbeam Close is unsuitable as an access road to the proposed development; the Close was never intended to serve traffic other than this existing small cul-de-sac;
- If residential development is allowed access should be via Tribune Way and not Hornbeam Close;
- Hornbeam Close is too narrow to allow cars to pass safely side-by-side and there is no off street parking provision for visitors. This creates the hazard of poor visibility and vehicles partially obstructing the footpath to park or having to mount the footpath to pass other vehicles;
- If the Close is used to access a further 12 properties in addition to the existing 13 properties, traffic levels are likely to double. This may compromise the safety of children and may increase the risk of accidents. The road is not adequate to serve 25 properties;
- The increased traffic levels would reduce the quality of life that was expected when the original properties on Hornbeam Close were purchased;

- There may be a loss of security and privacy and an increase in lighting levels and an exacerbation of an existing drainage problem;
- The proposal may de-value the existing properties in the area;
- The increase in dwellings would increase traffic levels on the local road network which could increase the risk of accidents;
- If the housing area was connected to the industrial estate it could be used as a cut through in order to access Clifton Moorgate;
- The land is allocated for employment and the need to create local employment opportunities has never been greater with high profile job losses announced in York recently. A dangerous precedent could be set if this employment land is lost;
- There is no affordable housing provision;
- Fire and Ambulance services would have great difficulty in accessing the proposed development using Hornbeam Close as an access route;
- The sewerage system has struggled to cope with the current waste which has caused numerous problems over the last 6 years;
- Developing the site would mean HGV lorries passing through the estate which would cause nuisance.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 Key Issues:

Residential Issues

- Residential Development on land which is part of a Standard Employment Site
- Residential Density
- Affordable Housing
- Efficient Use of Land
- Highways

Light Industrial Issues

- Design
- Highways

4.2 The Application Site - An application was submitted and later withdrawn in 2006 for residential development at the application site plus light industrial developments. At this time access to the residential development was to be via Tribune Way off Clifton Moorgate. The applicant purchased extra land to the south of the proposed residential development which provided the landowners with the opportunity to apply for access through Hornbeam Close. A second application was submitted and withdrawn later in 2006 for residential development only, again with access through Hornbeam Close. This third application incorporates both residential and industrial development. The proposed residential development is only in outline with access and siting under consideration. Full planning permission is sought for the proposed light industrial units. The whole of the application site is allocated as a standard employment site where B1 (Business), B2 (General Industrial), and B8 (Storage or Distribution) uses are acceptable.

Issues relating to the proposed Residential Development

Loss of Standard Employment Site

4.3 Draft Local Plan Policy E3b states that standard employment sites (such as Centurion Park) will be retained within their current use class. Planning permission

for other uses will only be given where: a) there is a sufficient supply of employment land to meet both medium and longer term requirements in both qualitative and quantitative terms; AND conforms with ONE of the following criteria: b) unacceptable environmental problems exist; or c) the development of the site for other appropriate uses will lead to significant benefits to the local economy; or d) the use is ancillary to an employment use.

4.4 The application for outline permission to erect 12 dwellings must conform with part a) and one of parts b) to d) in policy E3b as outlined above. Parts b) and d) do not appear to be of relevance for this application as environmental problems are not evident and residential development is not considered ancillary to the existing or proposed employment units. It is considered that the applicant has failed to demonstrate how the proposal satisfies sections a) and c). First considering section a), the applicant has failed to supply robust evidence which justifies the loss of employment land for present and future B1, B2, and B8 use. Whilst the application site is relatively small in relation to the entire site it could set a precedent for further reduction in employment land provision over time. Due to the constraints placed on the availability of greenfield development sites around York by the existing Green Belt, it is particularly important to ensure that land currently designated for employment uses are safeguarded for their identified land-uses. In attempting to satisfy part c) the applicant has stated that the proposed residential units are required to make the light industrial units financially viable. Little evidence has been submitted which substantiates this claim.

Residential Density

4.5 Draft Local Plan Policy CYGP1 states that development proposals will be expected to be of a density that is compatible with neighbouring buildings, spaces and the character of the area.

4.6 Draft Local Plan Policy H5a states that proposed residential developments should be compatible with the character of the surrounding area. Applications for all new residential developments should aim to achieve net residential densities of 40 dwellings per hectare in the urban area.

4.7 The proposed development is for 12 dwellings on approximately 0.28ha, this equates to approximately 43 dph. The density of the existing housing development south of the application site is of a similar density to that proposed. PPS3 Housing states that 30 dph minimum should be used as a guide for future housing and the Local Plan aims to achieve 40 dph in the urban area. The proposed housing is considered acceptable in terms of density in line with local and national policy and the character of the surrounding area.

Affordable Housing Provision

4.8 Draft Local Plan Policy H2a states that proposals for all new housing development with a site area of 0.3Ha or more in the urban area will be required to provide affordable housing provision.

4.9 There is a continued need for the development of affordable housing within York. The Housing Need Survey shows that there is a strong demand for affordable housing in order to meet current and future accommodation needs. The size of the

proposed housing site has been reduced from the previous application to below the 0.3 ha affordable housing activation level and therefore there is no requirement to provide affordable housing on this development at this time. As outlined within the policy team's consultation response the site is seen as a whole and therefore any further housing development in the future would be added to the size of the proposed development within this application and therefore affordable housing would be required at that stage.

Efficient Use of Land within the Urban Area

4.10 A previous application for housing on this site had a larger site area. The area of the proposed housing development has been reduced for this application by bringing the site boundary in on the Western side. This therefore leaves an unused strip of land between the proposed housing development and employment development West of the site. The location and size of this area of land means that it serves little purpose and would be difficult to develop in the future. PPS1: Delivering Sustainable Development and PPS3: Housing highlight the need for the effective and efficient use of land in sustainable locations. It is therefore considered that the development potential of this land within the urban area would not be utilised which in turn could put pressure on land to be developed in the future which is within a less sustainable location.

Highways

4.11 There were a large number of neighbour objections concerning the suitability of Hornbeam Close as an access road for 12 new dwellings. Highway Network Management looked into the proposal and could not find any strong reason for refusing this application. It has been suggested that the cul-de-sac is capable of supporting 25 dwellings. The structure and design of the road act as a barrier to travelling at speed along Hornbeam Close.

Issues relating to the proposed Light Industrial development

Design

4.12 The area around the application site is dominated by light industrial units and car dealerships of typical design. Unit 4 already exists on site, this application seeks permission to expand this and provide a new premises, Unit 5, north of Unit 4. The proposed extension of Unit 4 follows the design principles contained within the existing unit and surrounding area, such as being of a similar height, having rounded roofs and incorporating matching materials. The applicant states that this extension would be used part as a laboratory (single storey element) and part as a warehouse. The warehouse element has little fenestration, this is similar to the warehouse / distribution depot which is located adjacent to Water Lane. Unit 5 is significantly smaller in scale than the proposed Unit 4 extension but is of similar style and would also house a warehouse. It is considered that the proposed light industrial developments would appear in keeping with the surrounding area. There is some space between the proposed developments and the site boundary which allows scope for some green landscaping which could soften the visual impact of these units.

Highways

4.13 Local car parking standards in line with PPG13: Transport are set out in Appendix E of the Local Plan. The data provides maximum car parking standards which should not be exceeded, this is to encourage more sustainable forms of travel. Using Appendix E it is calculated that the maximum provision for Unit 4 should be 25 car parking spaces. The proposed number of car parking spaces at Unit 4 is 42 and therefore this is contrary to Policy SP8 of the Local Plan.

5.0 CONCLUSION

Inappropriate residential development on land allocated for employment use.
Inefficient use of land in the urban area.
Over supply of car parking spaces at Unit 4.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

- 1 The application site lies within an area which is designated as a standard employment site. It is considered that it has not been proven that there is a sufficient supply of employment land to meet immediate and longer term requirements or that the proposed change of use would lead to significant benefits to the local economy. Therefore the proposed residential development is considered contrary to Policy E3b of the City of York Draft Local Plan.
- 2 The application site is within the urban area and it is considered to be in a sustainable location. The proposed residential development creates a small unused area of land to the West of the site. Due to its location and size, this land would not be capable of further development in the future. Therefore it is considered that the proposed residential development would not lead to an effective and efficient use of this site which could place development pressure on land within less sustainable locations in the future. This is considered contrary to PPS1 and PPS3.
- 3 The application site is within a sustainable location and can be accessed by a variety of transport modes. Maximum car parking standards are in place to encourage more sustainable transport choices and reduce car use. The 42 proposed car parking spaces at Unit 4 exceed the maximum standards of 25 which are set out in Appendix E of the Local Plan. It is therefore considered that the proposed development is contrary to the City of York Draft Local Plan Policy SP8: Reducing Dependence on the Car.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Contact details:

Author: Michael Jones Development Control Officer
Tel No: 01904 551325